



United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE

1849 C Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240

IN REPLY REFER TO:

FEB 6 2012

Re: **1114 Kanawha Boulevard East, Charleston, West Virginia**
Project Number: **26084**

Dear

I have concluded my review of your appeal of the decision of Technical Preservation Services (TPS), denying certification of the rehabilitation of the property cited above. The appeal was initiated and conducted in accordance with Department of the Interior regulations (36 CFR Part 67) governing certifications for Federal income tax incentives for historic preservation as specified in the Internal Revenue Code. I thank you for meeting with me in Washington on January 26, 2012, and for providing a detailed account of the project.

After careful review of the complete record for this project, including the materials you submitted after our meeting, I have determined that the rehabilitation of 1114 Kanawha Boulevard East, (aka the "Guy Gibson House") is not consistent with the historic character of the property and the historic district in which it is located, and that the project does not meet Standards 2 and 9 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (the Standards). Therefore, the denial issued on December 5, 2011, by TPS is hereby affirmed. However, I have further determined that the project could be brought into conformance with the Standards, and thereby be certified, if the corrective measure described below is undertaken.

Built c. 1905, the house at 1114 Kanawha Boulevard East is located in the Downtown Charleston Historic District. It was certified as contributing to the significance of the historic district on June 15, 2011. The in-progress rehabilitation of this "certified historic structure" was found not to meet the Standards owing to the construction of a rooftop addition. The rehabilitation otherwise preserves the features and finishes of the house.

The rooftop addition provides the necessary height required to insert a second egress stairway that permits office—as opposed to the original residential—occupancy in the former attic on the third floor. The new stairway fills the west end of a porch that had been previously enclosed on the first floor, and a similar space directly above on the second floor. I have determined that the alteration of these two secondary spaces is an acceptable treatment. However, the new stairway projects through the original roof across the north (rear) elevation and northern third of the east (side) elevation on the third floor. Although, this addition is not visible from directly in front of the house or from Kanawha Boulevard to the west, it is visible from Kanawha Boulevard to the east and from other publicly accessible spaces within the historic district at the rear of the property. I agree with TPS that the addition has an unfortunate and detrimental impact on the originally symmetrical massing of the hipped roof, which is a character-defining feature of this "American four-square" house. As a result, I find that the prominence of the addition brings the rehabilitation into conflict with Standards 2 and 9. Standard 2 states, "*The historic character of a*

property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.” Standard 9 states, “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”

The new porch and accessibility ramp off the rear elevation, which in themselves are acceptable additions to the property, are constructed primarily of unpainted pressure-treated lumber. Consequently, I have determined that the unfinished appearance of the pressure-treated wood contrasts markedly with the otherwise finished character this early 20th-century structure, and thus find that it brings the rehabilitation into further conflict with Standard 9, quoted above.

Although the rehabilitation cannot be approved in its current state, I have further determined it could be brought into conformance with the Standards, and thus achieve the certification you seek, if two changes were made. First, the HardiPlank siding of the addition must be painted to match the color of the slate used on the roof and cheek walls of the original dormers. Painting it in this manner will allow the addition—currently painted white—to blend into the roof by lessening its visual contrast with the original roof materials, and consequently diminishing its detrimental impact on the historic character of the building. Second, the unpainted columns, railings and balusters of the porch and ramp at the rear must be painted to match the other historic trim on the building. With these modifications, I have determined that the overall impact of the rehabilitation on the property will comply with the Standards.

If you choose to proceed with the corrective measures described above, prior to undertaking further work, please submit a Part 2 amendment, with a proposed painting scheme for the rooftop addition, and rear porch and ramp, to this office, Attention: _____ with a copy to the West Virginia State Historic Preservation Office. Note that this project will remain ineligible for the tax incentives until it is designated a “certified rehabilitation” following completion of all project work.

As Department of the Interior regulations state, my decision is the final administrative decision with respect to the December 5, 2011, denial that TPS issued regarding rehabilitation certification. A copy of this decision will be provided to the Internal Revenue Service. Questions concerning specific tax consequences of this decision or interpretations of the Internal Revenue Code should be addressed to the appropriate office of the Internal Revenue Service.

Sincerely,



John A. Burns, FAIA
Chief Appeals Officer
Cultural Resources

cc: SHPO-WV
IRS